



THINKING SKILLS

Paper 4 Applied Reasoning

October/November 2023

1 hour 45 minutes

You will need: Answer booklet (enclosed)

- Answer **all** questions.
- Follow the instructions on the front cover of the answer booklet. If you need additional answer paper, ask the invigilator for a continuation booklet.

- The total mark for this paper is 50.
- The number of marks for each question or part question is shown in brackets [].

This document has **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

Questions 1 and 2 refer to Document 1.

- 1
 - (a) State the main conclusion of the argument. [1]
 - (b) Identify **two** intermediate conclusions in paragraphs 2 to 4. [2]
 - (c) Identify **one** counter-argument. [1]
 - (d) Analyse the structure of the reasoning in paragraph 5. [4]

- 2
 - (a) Identify and explain **three** flaws and/or weaknesses in the reasoning in paragraphs 3 to 6. [6]
 - (b) Assess the extent to which the reasoning in paragraph 2 supports the argument as a whole. [3]

- 3
 - (a) Document 5A contains a table of information about museum visitor numbers.

The table has been used to support a claim that 'The Elgin Marbles get 6 million visitors a year in the British Museum'.

Give **two** reasons why the support given by the table to this claim is weak. [2]
 - (b) Paragraph 4 of Document 4 contains some factual information.

Give **four** reasons why the support given by the figures in paragraph 4 to the claim that '400 000 visitors a year to a permanent exhibition would really boost the economy of the city' is weak. [4]

- 4

You are advised to spend some time planning your answer before you begin to write it.

'Culturally significant artefacts should be returned to their country of origin.'

Construct a reasoned argument to support **or** challenge this claim. In your answer you should make critical use of the documents provided. [27]

DOCUMENT 1

- 1 In the British Museum in London is a collection of large marble sculptures. They were brought to Britain 200 years ago by Thomas Bruce, the 7th Earl of Elgin, and are known as the Elgin Marbles. They were carved in the 5th Century BCE and originally displayed on the outside of the Parthenon, a now ruined temple on the Acropolis that overlooks Athens in Greece. In 2014, the eminent Hollywood actors George Clooney, Bill Murray and Matt Damon called for the return of the marbles to Greece.
- 2 Throughout history, invaders have plundered treasures and works of art from territories they have invaded, and this is certainly true of the large European empires that flourished between the 16th and 20th centuries. All artefacts stolen by imperial powers from territories they controlled should be returned to their place of origin. Greece is no longer part of the British Empire so any Greek artefacts in Britain should be returned to Greece.
- 3 The marbles were obtained illegally. In the early 19th century, Greece was part of the Ottoman Empire and ruled by the Sultan. In return for services to the Ottoman Empire, the Sultan allowed Elgin, British Ambassador at the time, 'liberty to take away any sculptures or inscriptions which do not interfere with the works or walls of the Citadel'. However, the marbles were on the surface, clearly 'interfering' with the walls.
- 4 It is often said that more people get to see the marbles in their current location in London, as the British Museum averages 6 million visitors a year. However, such large sculptures are best viewed in their original context. The Parthenon Marbles were designed to be viewed on the surface of the Parthenon, surrounded by other Ancient Greek buildings, on a hill overlooking Athens. The marbles belong in a museum in Athens, not in London.
- 5 Ancient Greek civilisation is part of the culture and identity of modern Greece. So it is not surprising that local residents look up at the Parthenon and feel proud that their ancestors built it. It would mean more to modern Athenians to have the marbles in their city than it means to have them in a city whose culture has no basis in Ancient Greece. So moving the marbles from London to Athens would increase happiness.
- 6 Some say that history is in the past so we should leave these artefacts where they are now and move forward together. We should ignore such people, who just want to preserve history as it was in the 19th century, along with all its injustices and poverty. The time has come for the Parthenon Marbles to be returned to Greece.

DOCUMENT 2

The Elgin Marbles are better off in the UK

One of the main reasons cited in support of returning the Marbles to Greece is the claim that their removal was illegal. Greece, at the time, was part of the Ottoman Empire. According to the British Museum, Lord Elgin 'acted with the full knowledge and permission of the legal authorities of the day', having received a decree from the Sultan, which permitted the removal of the Marbles. Many in Britain questioned the legality of this action when the Marbles first arrived but a UK parliamentary committee found in 1816 that the purchase was entirely legal under UK and international law. Though the original document is lost, a version translated into Italian and then into English reads: 'when they wish to take away any pieces of stone with old inscriptions or figures thereon, that no opposition be made thereto.'

Since gaining independence in 1832, successive Greek governments have been trying to get the Marbles back, but the argument that the Marbles are an important cultural symbol for the Greek nation is something of a political ploy based on sentiment and a simplistic, present-day view of history. At the time of the Marbles' creation, the nation of Greece did not exist. The Parthenon was not built to represent the glory, democracy or heritage of Greece, but to celebrate the military and cultural power of the city of Athens. The promotion of the Marbles as a cultural icon of Greek nationalism is, in the grand scheme of history, a recent and, in all probability, transient notion that is being used to serve the political agenda of the modern state.

It would be impossible to display the Marbles in a way that even vaguely resembles their original context. Since it was built, the Parthenon itself has experienced significant alterations. When it was converted into a Christian church in the 6th century many of its sculptures were damaged or removed. In the 15th century, under Ottoman rule, it was converted into a mosque. Used as a gunpowder store in the war against Venice, in 1687 the interior was partly destroyed in an explosion. Over the years its ruins have been used by locals for building material or taken as 'souvenirs' by rich European tourists in the 19th century. If the Marbles had remained in Athens for the last 200 years, they would have shared some of this fate. Even now, the Parthenon is vulnerable to degradation from Athens' well-known air pollution.

It could be argued that the Marbles' installation at the British Museum represents a significant contribution to our understanding of ancient Greek history, their display affording much closer inspection and appreciation than was ever possible in their original site. It is impossible to measure how many artists and historians have been inspired by seeing them up close. The Marbles have a much bigger number of viewers in the British Museum than they would have if they were sent back to Athens. Can we really say that the Marbles are more a part of the heritage of modern Greece than they are of Britain? They should really be regarded as part of the historical and cultural heritage of the world.

In their current position, visitors can appreciate their genius next to other objects from different times and places. Thus they are promoting educational principles of cultural internationalism, fostering cultural understanding, cooperation and a sense of shared values across modern-day national borders. Had the Marbles not been in one of the great museums of the world, they would be little commented on, just another bunch of overlooked, imperfectly preserved statues, which are relatively common in Greece.

DOCUMENT 3**Museum confronts country's colonial past**

The question of repatriating artefacts looted by past empires has risen across Europe in recent years. In 2017, President Emmanuel Macron commissioned a report which recommended the return of sub-Saharan African artefacts that are currently in French museums. In June 2020, France introduced a bill allowing the restitution of twenty-six artefacts to Benin and a historic sword to Senegal. German culture ministers have agreed to create the conditions for the repatriation of artefacts in public collections that were taken from former colonies in ways that are not legally or morally justifiable by today's standards. But one museum in the Netherlands has gone further.

Over the years, repatriations have occurred from the Dutch National Museum of World Cultures (NMVW) and other museums on an *ad hoc* basis, with each case being considered in isolation. In 2017, the museum began work on a guidance policy for repatriation of artefacts. The museum published a paper in 2019 which expressed 'the overall mission of the museum to address the long, complex and entangled histories that have resulted in the collections the museum holds.' It includes a commitment to address and evaluate claims for the return of cultural objects according to standards of respect, cooperation and timeliness.

The guidelines do not insist on evidence of artefacts having been looted, or otherwise obtained illegally. Nor do claimants have to prove that they have a suitable museum to house any returned objects. So far, there has been no public outcry from political groups in the Netherlands or the general public. However, the museum's director does not rule out the risk that some groups could use the repatriation of artefacts from Dutch museums to stoke nationalist sentiment.

The museum holds about 450 000 items, and it is estimated that about forty percent of the collection was acquired from former Dutch colonies. The initial focus for the project coordinators will be on Indonesia, although it has not yet received any official claims from there or elsewhere. In March 2020, the Dutch culture minister presented a large gold-inlaid dagger to the Indonesian ambassador on the basis of research conducted by the museum. The dagger had belonged to a Javanese rebel leader who fought against Dutch colonial rule in the 19th century.

The NMVW is also a member of a wider European museum group that oversees the handling of artefacts from the ancient kingdom of Benin, now in southern Nigeria. Initially artefacts will be loaned to Benin City on a rotational basis, but permanent repatriations are likely. However, the museum is merely the custodian of a national collection. Repatriations must be agreed by the Ministry of Culture. Museums have become a part of a political process. Restitution is not always solely about heritage; it is a political act.

DOCUMENT 4

Great success for Lindisfarne Gospels at Durham

The British Library in London is the permanent home of the Lindisfarne Gospels. *The Gospels* is an illuminated manuscript book, written in around 725 CE by Christian monks on the island of Lindisfarne, off the north-east coast of England. At the time of the book's production, Lindisfarne was the cultural and religious centre of the kingdom of Northumbria. Although written primarily in Latin, the book contains the oldest surviving translation of the Christian gospels into the language that was to become English. In the face of Viking raids, *The Gospels* was taken on a 200-year journey covering much of Northumbria, eventually settling at Durham in 1017. After residing in Durham Cathedral for over 500 years *The Gospels* fell into private hands and eventually entered the British Museum collection in 1753.

Although Northumbria disappeared as a political entity in the 10th century, most of it being incorporated into the emerging kingdom of England, *The Gospels* is seen by many, like Durham Cathedral itself, as an icon of the history and culture of north-eastern England and many have campaigned for the return of *The Gospels* to the North East. In 2013, the British Library agreed to allow *The Gospels* to be exhibited in Durham, but only for 3 months.

Professor Chris Higgins, Vice Chancellor of Durham University, which hosted the exhibition, said, 'We saw it as our role to engage people with the story of *The Gospels* beyond the exhibition, within schools and community groups, and to deliver an experience that could be enjoyed by people of all ages, from different walks of life and from different parts of the globe. The investment in the University Library now also means we have the highest standards of exhibition facilities, capable of hosting important artefacts from around the world and managing necessary environmental conditions.'

The exhibition attracted 100 000 visitors to the library in three months, and outreach sessions were delivered to more than 20 000 children. Local traders were pleased with the extra business, some declaring 2013 their best year ever. One trader, supporting a permanent return to Durham, said '100 000 visitors for 3 months is great; 400 000 visitors a year to a permanent exhibition would really boost the economy of the city.'

Historian Chris Kilkenny, from the Northumbrian Association, hopes *The Gospels* will return to Durham permanently. 'I don't believe in this idea that everything has to be in London. I think we're more than capable of looking after it and displaying it,' he said. 'Here, it means something. In a museum on the Euston Road, it doesn't mean so much.' The member of parliament for Durham also supports a repatriation of the book: '*The Gospels* is of huge cultural significance to the region and we have the capacity and skills to look after it,' she said.

But Professor Higgins disagrees, saying, 'Why should it be in the North East permanently? It's a national treasure, not a North East treasure.' A historian from the British Library said, 'The library recognises the significance of *The Gospels* for the North East, but it also recognises that *The Gospels* plays a very important part in the national collection. People from all over the world come to see it – literally thousands of people a day.'

DOCUMENT 5A

The world's most popular museums (by visitor number)

<i>Museum</i>	<i>City</i>	<i>Country</i>	<i>Visitors* (millions)</i>
Louvre	Paris	France	10.20
National Museum of China	Beijing	China	8.61
Metropolitan Museum of Art	New York	USA	7.36
Vatican Museums	Vatican City	Vatican City	6.76
National Air and Space Museum	Washington	USA	6.20
British Museum	London	UK	5.87
Tate Modern	London	UK	5.83
National Gallery	London	UK	5.74
Natural History Museum	London	UK	5.23
American Museum of Natural History	New York	USA	5.00

*Total number of visits in 2018

DOCUMENT 5B

A selection of artefacts whose repatriation has been demanded

<i>Artefact</i>	<i>Currently on display</i>	<i>Country of proposed return</i>	<i>Notes</i>
The Rosetta Stone	British Museum, London, UK	Egypt	Carvings on the stone allowed Egyptian hieroglyphs to be translated
The Man-Eaters of Tsavo	Field Museum, Chicago, USA	Kenya	The skins of two lions that killed dozens of railroad workers in Kenya in 1898
Magdala Ethiopian Treasures	Victoria and Albert Museum, London, UK	Ethiopia	Various artefacts looted by British forces after the battle of Magdala in 1868
The Bust of Nefertiti	Neues Museum, Berlin, Germany	Egypt	Carving of Egyptian Queen's head discovered in Egypt in 1912
The Elgin Marbles	British Museum, London, UK	Greece	Donated to the British Ambassador, some say illegally, by the Sultan of the Ottoman Empire
Zimbabwe Bird	Groot Schuur Museum, Cape Town, South Africa	Zimbabwe	The only one of 12 similar statues not to have already been returned
Benin Bronzes	Various European and US museums	Nigeria	Artefacts from the Kingdom of Benin (modern Nigeria), originally looted by British forces in 1897

BLANK PAGE

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (UCLES) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced online in the Cambridge Assessment International Education Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download at www.cambridgeinternational.org after the live examination series.

Cambridge Assessment International Education is part of Cambridge Assessment. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of the University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is a department of the University of Cambridge.